



APPROVED
SUMMARIZED MINUTES

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
SPECIAL MEETING**

THURSDAY, DECEMBER 3, 2015

**COMMUNITY DESIGN STUDIO
7506 INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85251**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Olmsted called the regular meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 6:05 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Steven Olmsted, Chair
Paul Holley, Vice Chair
Gary Bretz, Commissioner
Steven Rosenberg, Commissioner

ABSENT: Barry Graham, Commissioner
Jyme Sue McLaren, Commissioner
Robert Stickles, Commissioner

STAFF: Paul Basha, Director of Transportation
Frances Cookson, Office Coordinator
Phillip Kercher, Traffic Engineering and Operations Manager
Andrew Merkley, Traffic Engineering Analyst

3. PUBLIC COMMENT

No members of the public wished to address the Commission, however Chair Olmsted took the opportunity to discuss the purpose of special meetings. The intention has been to provide a forum for updates to the 2008 Transportation Master Plan. This is one of the special meeting activities relative to exploring the development of a next draft Transportation Master Plan. The basis for a Master Plan revision involves an understanding of the system itself and the activity occurring within the system.

4. 2014 TRAFFIC VOLUME AND COLLISION RATE REPORT

Andrew Merkley, Traffic Engineering Analyst, provided the report. Highlights included:

- The Traffic Volume and Collision Rate Data Report (Collision Manual), has been published for even numbered years since 1988, is a collaborative effort within the Traffic Engineering Department and contains traffic volume and collision data for 324 street segments and 203 street intersections.
- Traffic Engineering conducts a top 20 analysis of approximately 20 intersections that experience a high collision rate, analyze collision trends and conducts field visits at these locations. Mitigation measures are then recommended. These include signing and striping changes to capital improvement projects.
- Data collected for the Collision Manual comes from the collision database maintained by Traffic Engineering. Traffic volume data is collected by Traffic Engineering technicians over the two-year period with two counters placed at each intersection approach. Data is seasonally adjusted based on historical data. Volumes reported in the manual consist of the sum of all approaches to an intersection.
- The Collision Manual is broken into segment data and intersection data.
 - Segment data are divided into collision data and volume data. Segment collision rates and volume data are sorted by location and descending criteria as well as historical comparisons.
 - New to the 2014 manual, volume to capacity ratios are also included.
 - Intersection collision rate and volume data is sorted by intersection location with historical comparison.
- The collision rate is defined as the collision experience related to traffic exposure.
 - For segments, it is defined as collisions per million vehicle miles traveled, calculated using the annual number of collisions on the segment, the daily traffic volume and the segment length. The city-wide average segment collision rate in 2014 was 1.35 collisions per million vehicle miles traveled, representing an increase from the 2012 average rate of 1.31.
 - Intersection collision rates are defined as collisions per million vehicles entering the intersection. The 2014 average City-wide collision rate is 0.57 collisions per million vehicles entering the intersection, representing an increase for 2014 of 0.52.
 - For segments, the highest collision rate of 9.59 and a total of seven collisions was experienced on Camelback Road between Hayden and Granite Reef. Camelback Road between Scottsdale and Miller had a total collision rate of 7.69 and 31 collisions, due to a higher volume of traffic in this segment.
 - When sorted by highest frequency, the segment collision experience, Frank Lloyd Wright between Greenway Hayden and Hayden Road had the greatest number of collisions at 53. Shea Boulevard between Scottsdale Road and Hayden Road had 37.
 - For 2014 volume to capacity ratios, the highest ratio of 1.28 is experienced on Shea Boulevard between Loop 101 and 90th Street, followed by Chaparral Road between Miller and 78th Street, with a ratio of 1.22.
 - For intersection data, the highest collision rate experienced is 1.66 at the Loop 101 and Frank Lloyd Wright interchange, followed by the Hayden and Thomas intersection, with a rate of 1.61, the Loop 101 and Raintree interchange at 1.56 and the two Scottsdale Road intersections at 1.45.

- When intersections are sorted by highest frequency of collisions, the highest rate is experienced at the Loop 101 and Frank Lloyd Wright interchange at 51 collisions.
- The Collision Manual is useful in analyzing city-wide trends, based on metrics such as population, daily vehicle miles traveled, city-wide number of collisions, time of day, month of collision, manner of collision and violation by driver.
 - Between 2006 and 2012, there was a sharp decrease in collision rate, however this trend is reversing somewhat since 2014, with an increase in the rate.
 - Annual vehicle miles traveled show an increase from 1994 through 2006 with this rate stable since that time. The number of collisions sharply fell after 2006, but has increased since 2012.

Chair Olmsted asked for clarification on vehicle miles traveled. Mr. Merkley replied that vehicle miles traveled relates to the length of segments multiplied by volume.

- The annual average daily vehicle miles traveled per person in small cities in the United States is five to 15 miles. Phoenix and Tucson fall between the minimum and maximum average. The drop in daily vehicle miles traveled in Scottsdale between 1998 and 2000 is attributed to the opening of the Loop 101 Freeway. Since that time, it has been somewhat consist at approximately 17 daily miles.
- Collision data may also be sorted by collision attributes such as time of day. The highest percentage of collisions occur between 2:00 and 6:00 p.m., with the lowest percentage occurring between 3:00 a.m. and 6:00 a.m.
- For collisions by month, the highest percentage occurs between October and March, with the lower percentage occurring between April and September.
- The 2014 city-wide average of collisions by manner shows rear-ends at 42 percent, angle front to side at 19 percent, sideswipes same direction, single vehicle and left-turn collisions at approximately 10 percent.
- In the category of collisions according to driver violation, driving too fast for conditions accounts for the majority of violations at over 30 percent, followed by disregarded traffic signal, improper turn and inattention/distraction.

Highlights of the ensuing discussion included:

- In response to a question from Vice Chair Holley regarding a drop in intersection collision rates since 2010, Mr. Merkley attributed the drop to a combination of factors, including police enforcement and street system improvements. Mr. Basha added that the statistical analysis shows that segment collision rates have been decreasing for 30 years, while intersection collision rates have remained essentially the same.
- Chair Olmsted commented that the robust data analysis leads to projects to address the issues identified. He asked Mr. Merkley to address the example of the Hayden and Thomas project. Mr. Merkley stated that now that intersections with the highest collision rates have been identified, Traffic Engineering will select intersections to study and make recommendations for improvements. The timeline depends on the feasibility and cost of the recommended project. Hayden and Thomas had been consistently identified in the top five problem areas and was requested to be included in Maricopa County Association of Government's safety assessment program. The assessment was instrumental in allowing the City to apply for federal funds to do a safety project at the intersection. When Traffic Engineering conducts its own assessments or safety audits, some may result in recommendations for capital improvement projects. Mr. Basha stated that several years ago, initial

- recommendations from the City consultant included dramatically changing the Hayden Thomas intersection. However, the plan would have eliminated one-third to one-half of the businesses at the Hayden Thomas intersection. Staff examined the proposed solution and traffic patterns and developed a much more surgical solution. This resulted in a better design, requiring substantially less right-of-way, while allowing all of the businesses to be retained. Chair Olmsted suggested the creation of a flow chart to illustrate the process from data collection through project completion.
- A Commissioner noted the significant number of accidents along Frank Lloyd Wright, while there is a lower frequency at a similarly busy section at 101 and Shea. Mr. Merkley pointed out that Frank Lloyd Wright features frontage roads, which make traffic movements much more complicated. Mr. Basha commented that the ADOT study will include analyzing the 101 and Shea intersection and developing recommendations to reduce volumes.

5. TRANSPORTATION MASTER PLAN UPDATE

Paul Basha, Director of Transportation, provided the report. Highlights included:

- Streets designated as urban exist predominately in the southern portion of the city with the middle geographic area consisting of some urban designations near Shea Boulevard and the interchanges of the freeway and Scottsdale Road down to Frank Lloyd Wright and no urban streets north of Pinnacle Peak Road.
- Most streets in the City are designated as suburban. There are few suburban streets north of Pinnacle Peak Road.
- Rural streets are located primarily north of Pinnacle Peak Road. There are no rural streets in the Southern portion of the City. There are some located in the Shea Cactus Corridor.
- The Department is recommending very few changes to the street classifications. None are recommended for the central and southern portions of the City, except the indication that the interchanges will be analyzed in one designated area.
- In the northern portion, five locations have been identified, including: Dynamite Road east of 118th Street, Pima Road north of Dynamite Boulevard, 128th Street south of the Preserve, Ranch Gate Road, connecting 128th and 118th Streets and Jomax Road, connect Alma School Road and 118th Street. The classification of the streets will not change, however the construction of the streets will change. The recommended change will be one 12 foot vehicle lane per direction with a raised landscaped median and an eight foot wide bicycle lane.

Chair Olmsted asked for clarification on where construction projects appear and whether they are programmed now or in the future. Mr. Basha replied that there are a variety of ways the streets will be constructed. 128th Street will be constructed by the development on the east side. As part of the stipulations for approval of the development, they are required to construct both directions of the street as well as the raised landscape median. Typically, the City only requires developments to construct their adjacent half street. Ranch Gate Road is currently constructed at one lane per direction. Adjacent to the road is Arizona State Land property. They have been requested to use the existing street for eastbound when the property is sold and developed and will construct a raised landscape median north of the existing street. In addition, they will construct a westbound wide motor vehicle lane and wide bicycle lane. Jomax Boulevard is in the current capital improvement program for construction in the distant future, to be constructed with City funds. Dynamite Boulevard exists and

operates quite well as one lane per direction and is in the capital improvement plan for future construction. Pima Road is in the capital improvement program for future construction.

- Most streets are classified suburban, including a few streets north of Pinnacle Peak Road, dominated by Ranch Gate Road.
- Transit is located in two geographic areas: South of Indian Bend and Indian Bend to Pinnacle Peak Road. There are currently no trolley routes north of Indian Bend Road, however there are two Valley Metro routes and four City of Phoenix routes.
- The proposal includes Scottsdale Limited bus service on Scottsdale Road from Fashion Square to the Scottsdale Thunderbird Park and Ride lot, which would only have the two stops at Fashion Square and the Scottsdale Park and Ride lot.
- Starting in April of next year, Scottsdale Road Route 72 will operate at ten-minute frequency from Scottsdale Fashion Square into Tempe, connecting to the Rural University Light Rail Station.
- For the Airpark Trolley, one route exists on the west of the runway and one on the east. Both routes converge at the Scottsdale Thunderbird Park and Ride.
- The Cactus Trolley serves a number of streets, including Via Linda, Cactus, 96th Street, 94th Street and serves the businesses near the Pima Frank Lloyd Wright Interchange, and the Honor Health facility and retail businesses at Pima and Shea.
- The Mustang Transit Center improvements are currently under design.

A Commissioner suggested that when costs for additional routes are being calculated, especially along Scottsdale Road, the ADA obligation should be reviewed, as currently the route does not go that far north. The same is also true for some of the trolley routes. Mr. Basha replied that Route 72 currently extends to Thompson Peak Parkway. There were discussions regarding extending the route to Pinnacle Peak Road; the Department's recommendation was to not extend it the two extra miles. This is a relatively low ridership area, and there are higher priorities, such as the Cactus Trolley and the Airpark Trolley.

- Construction costs will be significant and there will be applications for federal and regional grants. Next year's budget requests will include Scottsdale Limited, the Airpark Trolley and the Cactus Trolley. It takes approximately two years to acquire the vehicles. Approval must first be received from the City Manager's Office, followed by the City Treasurer's Office and ultimately, City Council.

Vice Chair Holley inquired about the possibility of requesting funds from the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community for construction in the area of the Pavilions and Pima Road. Mr. Basha clarified that construction does not enter Indian Community land. Conversations have taken place for the McDowell Road bus service going to the casino near McKellips Road, and the Indian Community shares in this funding. When the bus system becomes more robust, service of the Pavilions would be included.

- Shared use paths and multiuse paths are typically separate from roadways and provide the highest level of bicycle travel for the general public. They are particularly popular with those in wheelchairs, parents with strollers and relatively inexperienced cyclists. There are locations in the southern part of the City, including Indian Bend Wash and along the canal. In the central part of the City, the Indian Bend Wash bicycle path continues north into the Camelback Walk area. Farther north, it crosses the Central Arizona Project Canal, providing bicycle path systems throughout McDowell Mountain Ranch and into the Greyhawk area.

- There are approximately 300 projects totaling approximately 200 miles, with high, medium and low priority designations. High priorities are generally located in the central portion of the City with some into the southern portion. The northern portion consists mainly of medium and low priorities. Dynamite Boulevard and Pinnacle Peak Road are medium priorities.
- Although there is a priority ranking, whenever there is a street project in the vicinity of a low or medium priority for motor vehicle travel priority purposes, the bicycle improvements are included.

Highlights of the ensuing discussion included:

- Mr. Basha stated that slides are available pertaining to McDowell Road, should the Commission wish to see them. He added that there has been consideration for narrowing McDowell Road from six lanes to four lanes. Vice Chair Holley commented that the consideration is premature and that it would be wise to wait five years to see what occurs as far as development along McDowell Road. Mr. Basha voiced agreement.
- Vice Chair Holley commented that the Paths and Trails Committee will want to review the relevant portions of the Plan.
- A Commissioner asked about previous discussions on mass transit and high speed options. Mr. Basha noted that those have been presented previously and have not changed since they were last provided. They will be included as part of the transit element of the Transportation Master Plan at the next meeting. Chair Olmsted commented that they should have been included, given the significance of some of these larger projects.
- A Commissioner asked how the Bike Share Program fits into the Plan. Mr. Basha stated that it is an additional program that does not affect the infrastructure.

CHAIR OLMSTED MOVED TO CONTINUE FORWARD WITH THIS SEGMENT OF THE TRANSPORTATION MASTER PLAN AS PRESENTED, PENDING RELEVANT SEGMENTS BEING PRESENTED TO THE PATHS AND TRAILS SUBCOMMITTEE. COMMISSIONER BRETZ SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF FOUR (4) TO ZERO (0). COMMISSIONERS GRAHAM, MCLAREN AND STICKLES WERE ABSENT.

6. OTHER TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND PROGRAM STATUS

Paul Basha provided the report. Highlights included:

- A previous meeting had included discussion of the possibility of purchasing electric busses. Madeline Clemann and John Kelley visited the electric bus manufacturing facility in Southern California. The Department's opinion is that the manufacturer is not quite ready to move forward with the City of Scottsdale and is in the midst of a number of discussions with municipalities throughout the country. In addition, the manufacturer would be depended on to prepare the grant application, which was due November 23rd. Hybrid vehicles will continue to be purchased and next year, the Department will again pursue the purchase of electric only buses.
- Scottsdale has once again been designated a Gold Standard Bike Friendly Community by the League of American Bicyclists. The designation will be in place for five years

with a goal to improve bicycle facilities once again and then submit for a platinum ranking.

- The Department continues with its preparation of the Wayfinding Program documents and will present those in February or March of 2016.
- The City Council approved construction of a portion of Arizona Canal multiuse path last month after a five year process. There were a number of public meetings with a number of public concerns addressed during the process. Regional funding represents 50 percent of the project cost. Construction is anticipated to begin in April, however the contractor has ideas for expediting construction. Completion is estimated for late summer or early fall.
- Last year, a variable speed limit was implemented on Camelback Road between Scottsdale Road and Miller Road. On October 24th at 1:50 a.m., an inebriated pedestrian was crossing Camelback Road mid-block. He was struck by a vehicle, however the vehicle was only traveling 25 miles per hour, as this was the posted speed limit at that time. The pedestrian was released from the hospital with no injuries. In the late evenings on Friday and Saturday night into the early mornings of Saturday and Sunday, the speed limit changes to 25.

Highlights of the ensuing discussion included:

- Vice Chair Holley inquired as to whether the League of American Bicyclists provides suggestions for improvements. Mr. Basha replied that specific recommendations are not provided, however, they do provide criteria for each award category. The criteria for platinum designation are being incorporated into the Transportation Master Plan and the Capital Improvement Program.
- In response to a question from a Commissioner, Mr. Basha stated that he was unfamiliar with the total number of gold designations in the state and platinum designations in the country, but that there are a few platinum communities, including one in Oregon. There are approximately three to five dozen gold designations in the country.
- In response to a request from a Commissioner, Mr. Basha stated that the design plans for the multiuse path have been brought to the Committee before, but could be brought back for additional review.
- Vice Chair Holley suggested that there might be other areas in the City where a variable speed limit would be beneficial. Mr. Basha replied that the Camelback location was a one-time installation and is particular to adjacent businesses. He added that this was the first location in North America where a variable speed limit sign was used on an arterial street. Throughout the country, variable speed limits are used in mountain states, where there are snow conditions and are also used in highly congested urban freeway locations.
- Bicycle racks have been recently installed in front of Scottsdale Stadium, on the Osborn side. They were designed by City employees on City time, so there was no additional design expense, other than materials. Another row is planned for the Scottsdale Road side of the stadium. Five additional designs will be installed throughout the Civic Center Mall area.
- The most recent neighborhood traffic management program is located at Cholla Road between Hayden and 84th Street. It includes two side island pairs and a central island currently under construction. It is hoped construction will be complete by Christmas.
- A segment of Camelback Road near Fashion Square west of Scottsdale Road was recently repaved. As part of the project, the lanes were re-stripped to provide bicycle

lanes. Paint striping is complete, but the thermoplastic for the bicycle lanes has not yet been applied and is hoped to be completed by Christmas.

- Chair Olmsted commented that he has received emails from downtown business owners on the parking situation and requested to agendaize an update on the downtown traffic study. Mr. Basha confirmed that it is on the agenda for the December 17th meeting. At last night's City Council meeting, the Council directed the Department to provide recommendations as soon as possible, which will likely be in January.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no public comments.

8. ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to conduct, Chair Olmsted adjourned the special meeting at 8:09 p.m.

SUBMITTED BY:

A/V Tronics, Inc. DBA AVTranz.

***Note: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transp.asp>**